

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CLARKSBURG DIVISION**

<b>STATE OF OHIO, et al.,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Plaintiffs,</b>	:	CASE NO: 1:23-cv-00100
	:	
<b>v.</b>	:	Judge John Preston Bailey
	:	
<b>NATIONAL COLLEGIATE ATHLETIC ASSOCIATION</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Defendant.</b>	:	

**JOINT MOTION OF PLAINTIFF STATES AND DEFENDANT NATIONAL  
COLLEGIATE ATHLETIC ASSOCIATION FOR ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT  
AND PERMANENT INJUNCTION**

Plaintiff States of Ohio, Colorado, Illinois, Minnesota, Mississippi, New York, North Carolina, Tennessee, and West Virginia, the Commonwealth of Virginia, and the District of Columbia (“Plaintiff States”) and Defendant National Collegiate Athletic Association have negotiated and agreed to resolve all issues in this matter in accordance with the terms of the Proposed Consent Judgment and Permanent Injunction attached to this filing as Exhibit A. Plaintiff States and Defendant respectfully request that this Court enter the attached Proposed Consent Judgment and Permanent Injunction in resolution of this litigation between those parties. Co-Plaintiff United States of America has also reached a resolution with Defendant and will be making a separate filing with the Court.

Dated: May 30, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

DAVE YOST  
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

Erik Clark  
Deputy Attorney General for Major Litigation

Jennifer L. Pratt  
Director of Major Litigation

Beth A. Finnerty  
Section Chief, Antitrust Section

*s/ William C. Becker*  
William C. Becker (*pro hac vice*)  
Principal Assistant Attorney General

*s/ Steven Oldham*  
Steven Oldham (*pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General, Major Litigation

*s/ Edward J. Olszewski*  
Edward J. Olszewski (*pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Section Chief, Antitrust Section

*s/ Derek M. Whiddon*  
Derek M. Whiddon (*pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust Section

Office of the Ohio Attorney General  
30 E. Broad St., 26th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Telephone: (614) 466-4328  
Email: William.Becker@OhioAGO.gov  
Steven.Oldham@OhioAGO.gov  
Edward.Olszewski@OhioAGO.gov  
Derek.Whiddon@OhioAGO.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Ohio*

**FOR PLAINTIFF COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA:**

JASON S. MIYARES  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF VIRGINIA

KEVIN M. GALLAGHER  
Principal Deputy Solicitor General

STEVEN G. POPPS  
Deputy Attorney General  
Civil Division

/s/ Tyler T. Henry  
TYLER T. HENRY (*pro hac vice*)  
Senior Assistant Attorney General and Manager  
Antitrust Unit

/s/ Jonathan M. Harrison II  
JONATHAN M. HARRISON II (*pro hac vice*)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection Section

Office of the Virginia Attorney General  
202 North 9th Street  
Richmond, Virginia 23219  
Phone: (804) 496-0485  
THenry@oag.state.va.us  
JHarrison@oag.state.va.us

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Virginia*

**FOR PLAINTIFF DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA:**

BRIAN SCHWALB  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

/s/ Adam Gitlin

ADAM GITLIN, Chief, Antitrust and Nonprofit Enforcement Section  
(*pro hac vice*)

MEHREEN IMTIAZ, Assistant Attorney General  
(*pro hac vice*)

Office of the Attorney General for the District of Columbia  
400 6th Street, N.W, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Phone: 202-442-9864 (Gitlin)  
adam.gitlin@dc.gov  
mehreen.imtiaz@dc.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff District of Columbia*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF COLORADO**

PHILIP J. WEISER  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

/s/ Bryn Williams

BRYN WILLIAMS

First Assistant Attorney General (*pro hac vice*)

ELIZABETH W. HEREFORD

Assistant Attorney General (*pro hac vice*)

Colorado Department of Law  
Office of the Attorney General  
Ralph L. Carr Judicial Center  
1300 Broadway, 7th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203

Telephone: (720) 508-6000

Email: Bryn.Williams@coag.gov

Elizabeth.Hereford@coag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF ILLINOIS:**

KWAME RAOUL, ATTORNEY GENERAL

/s/ Elizabeth L. Maxeiner

ELIZABETH L. MAXEINER, Chief, Antitrust Bureau

Elizabeth L. Maxeiner, Chief, Antitrust Bureau (*pro hac vice*)

Brian M. Yost, Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust Bureau (*pro hac vice*)

Daniel R. Betancourt, Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust Bureau (*pro hac vice*)

Office of the Illinois Attorney General

115 S. LaSalle St., Fl. 23

Chicago, IL 60603

Phone: (773) 790-7935

Elizabeth.maxeiner@ilag.gov

Brian.yost@ilag.gov

Daniel.betancourt@ilag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Illinois*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF MINNESOTA:**

KEITH ELLISON  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

s/ Elizabeth Odette

ELIZABETH ODETTE, Assistant Attorney General, Manager, Antitrust Division

James W. Canaday, Deputy Attorney General, Consumer Protection Division (*pro hac vice*)

Elizabeth Odette, Assistant Attorney General, Manager, Antitrust Division (*pro hac vice*)

Jon Woodruff, Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust Division (*pro hac vice*)

Office of the Minnesota Attorney General

445 Minnesota St., Suite #1400

St. Paul, MN 55101

Phone: (651) 728-7208 (Odette)

James.Canaday@ag.state.mn.us

Elizabeth.Odette@ag.state.mn.us

Jon.Woodruff@ag.state.mn.us

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Minnesota*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF MISSISSIPPI:**

LYNN FITCH  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

*s/ Caleb Pracht*

Caleb Pracht (*pro hac vice*)

Special Assistant Attorney General, Consumer Protection Division

Mississippi Office of the Attorney General

550 High Street

P.O. Box 220

Jackson, MS 39205

Telephone: 601-359-4223

Caleb.Pracht@ago.ms.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Mississippi*



**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF NEW YORK:**

LETITIA JAMES  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

Christopher D'Angelo  
Chief Deputy Attorney General,  
Economic Justice Division

s/ Elinor R. Hoffmann  
Elinor R. Hoffmann (*pro hac vice*)  
Chief, Antitrust Bureau

s/ Amy McFarlane  
Amy McFarlane (*pro hac vice*)  
Deputy Chief, Antitrust Bureau

s/ Bryan Bloom  
Bryan Bloom (*pro hac vice*)  
Senior Enforcement Counsel, Antitrust Bureau

New York State Office of the Attorney General  
28 Liberty Street  
New York, NY 10005  
Telephone: (212) 416-8269 (Hoffmann)  
Email: Elinor.Hoffmann@ag.ny.gov  
Amy.McFarlane@ag.ny.gov  
Bryan.Bloom@ag.ny.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New York*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA:**

JOSHUA H. STEIN  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NORTH CAROLINA

*/s/ Jonathan R. Marx*

JASMINE MCGHEE\*

Senior Deputy Attorney General

JONATHAN R. MARX\*

Special Deputy Attorney General

KUNAL CHOKSI\*

Special Deputy Attorney General

North Carolina Department of Justice  
114 W. Edenton St  
Raleigh, NC 27603  
Telephone: (919) 716-8611  
Email: jmarx@ncdoj.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North Carolina*

*\*pro hac vice*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF TENNESSEE:**

JONATHAN SKRMETTI  
ATTORNEY GENERAL AND REPORTER

*/s/ J. David McDowell*

J. DAVID MCDOWELL

Deputy, Consumer Protection Division (*pro hac vice*)

ETHAN BOWERS

Senior Assistant Attorney General (*pro hac vice*)

TYLER T. CORCORAN

Assistant Attorney General (*pro hac vice*)

Office of the Attorney General and Reporter

P.O. Box 20207

Nashville, TN 37202

Phone: (615) 741-8722

Email: David.McDowell@ag.tn.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Tennessee*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA  
AND AS LOCAL COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFFS  
STATE OF OHIO, COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA,  
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA, AND STATES OF COLORADO,  
ILLINOIS, MINNESOTA, MISSISSIPPI, NEW YORK,  
NORTH CAROLINA, AND TENNESSEE:**

STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA ex rel.  
PATRICK MORRISEY, ATTORNEY GENERAL

*/s/ Michael R. Williams*

Michael R. Williams, Principal Deputy Solicitor General  
Douglas L. Davis, Sr. Assistant Attorney General  
Matthew M. Morrison, Assistant Attorney General

Office of the West Virginia Attorney General  
P.O. Box 1789  
Charleston, WV 25326  
Ph. (304) 558-8986  
Fax. (304) 558-0184  
Michael.R.Williams@wvago.gov  
Douglas.L.Davis@wvago.gov  
Matt.M.Morrison@wvago.gov

*Counsel for Plaintiff State of West Virginia and  
Local Counsel for Plaintiffs State of Ohio, Commonwealth of Virginia,  
District of Columbia, and States of Colorado, Illinois, Minnesota,  
Mississippi, New York, North Carolina, and Tennessee*

**FOR DEFENDANT NATIONAL COLLEGIATE ATHLETIC ASSOCIATION:**

/s/ Benjamin L. Bailey

Benjamin L. Bailey (WVSB No. 200)  
Christopher D. Smith (WVSB No. 13050)  
BAILEY & GLASSER LLP  
209 Capitol Street  
Charleston, WV 25302  
Telephone: (304) 345-6555  
Facsimile: (304) 342-1110  
bbailey@baileyglasser.com  
csmith@baileyglasser.com

Philip D. Bartz (Admitted Pro Hac Vice)  
BRYAN CAVE LEIGHTON PAISNER LLP  
1155 F Street NW, Suite 700  
Washington, DC 20004  
(202) 508-6000 (phone)  
(202) 508-6200 (fax)  
Philip.bartz@bclplaw.com

Stephen M. Scannell (Admitted Pro Hac Vice)  
BRYAN CAVE LEIGHTON PAISNER LLP  
211 North Broadway Street, Suite 3600  
St. Louis, MO 63102  
(314) 259-2516 (phone)  
(314) 259-2020 (fax)  
Stephen.scannell@bclplaw.com

Benjamin J. Hogan (WVSB No. 12997)  
BRYAN CAVE LEIGHTON PAISNER LLP  
1700 Lincoln Street, Suite 4100  
Denver, CO 80203-5451  
(303) 866-7000 (phone)  
(303) 866-0200 (fax)  
Ben.hogan@bclplaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant National Collegiate Athletic Association*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Douglas Davis, do hereby certify that on the 30th Day of May 2024, I filed the foregoing document titled ***JOINT MOTION OF PLAINTIFF STATES AND DEFENDANT NATIONAL COLLEGIATE ATHLETIC ASSOCIATION FOR ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT AND PERMANENT INJUNCTION*** using the Court's CM/ECF system which will send notification to all counsel of record.

*s/ Douglas L. Davis*

Douglas L. Davis  
Sr. Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the West Virginia Attorney  
General

*Counsel for Plaintiff State of West Virginia  
and Local Counsel for Plaintiffs State of  
Ohio, Commonwealth of Virginia, District of  
Columbia, and States of Colorado, Illinois,  
Minnesota, Mississippi, New York, North  
Carolina, and Tennessee*



IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CLARKSBURG DIVISION

STATE OF OHIO,  
STATE OF COLORADO,  
STATE OF ILLINOIS,  
STATE OF MINNESOTA,  
STATE OF MISSISSIPPI,  
STATE OF NEW YORK,  
STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA,  
STATE OF TENNESSEE,  
COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA,  
STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA,  
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA, and  
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Civil No. 1:23-cv-100  
Judge John Preston Bailey

Plaintiffs,

v.

NATIONAL COLLEGIATE  
ATHLETIC ASSOCIATION,

Defendant.

**[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AND PERMANENT INJUNCTION**

1. WHEREAS the Plaintiff States of Ohio, Colorado, Illinois, Minnesota, Mississippi, New York, North Carolina, Tennessee, and West Virginia; the Commonwealth of Virginia; the District of Columbia (collectively, “States”); and the United States of America have brought this action alleging violations of the Sherman Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1 et. seq, against Defendant National Collegiate Athletic Association (“NCAA”).



2. WHEREAS the Plaintiff States, through their respective Attorneys General, are duly authorized to bring suits for injunctive relief to enforce the Sherman Act pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §§ 1 and 26.

3. WHEREAS Plaintiff United States of America is duly authorized to bring suits for injunctive relief to enforce the Sherman Act pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §§ 1 and 4.

4. WHEREAS all parties consent to this venue and to the personal jurisdiction of the Court for purposes of this litigation, entry of the Consent Judgment, and any subsequent litigation to enforce its terms.

5. WHEREAS this Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this action under 15 U.S.C. § 4 and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1337(a), and in the case of plaintiff United States, 28 U.S.C. § 1345.

6. WHEREAS the NCAA's member institutions and conferences have adopted rules and regulations governing certain aspects of college sports.

7. WHEREAS NCAA Bylaw<sup>1</sup> 14.5.5.1, herein referred to as the Transfer Eligibility Rule, provides that certain transfer students shall not be eligible for intercollegiate competition in Division I until they have fulfilled an academic "year of residence" at their new institution, unless they qualify for a transfer exception or secure a waiver.

---

<sup>1</sup> All references to "Bylaws" or "NCAA Rules" are to the *NCAA Division I 2023-24 Manual*.

8. WHEREAS Plaintiffs allege that the Transfer Eligibility Rule has unreasonably restrained competition for Division I student-athletes among schools and has prevented them from realizing the benefits of free and open competition for their athletic services.

9. WHEREAS Plaintiffs allege that the Transfer Eligibility Rule yields few, if any, procompetitive benefits.

10. WHEREAS Plaintiffs allege that, as a direct result of the NCAA's conduct, Division I student-athletes and consumers of college athletics have suffered and continue to suffer antitrust injury due to the reduction in competition among member institutions for student-athletes' services.

11. WHEREAS Plaintiffs therefore allege that the Transfer Eligibility Rule is an illegal agreement to restrain and suppress competition in the nationwide market for Division I student-athletes' labor in intercollegiate athletics, in violation of Section 1 of the Sherman Act.

12. WHEREAS NCAA Bylaw 12.11.4.2, herein referred to as the Rule of Restitution, provides that, if a student-athlete obtains an injunction against the NCAA, and the student-athlete and his or her member institution conduct themselves in conformity with that injunction, the NCAA may nonetheless impose certain penalties on both the student-athlete and the member institution if the injunction is ultimately vacated, stayed, or reversed.

13. WHEREAS Plaintiffs allege that the Rule of Restitution deters member institutions from relying on court orders finding that the NCAA's rules are

anticompetitive (or otherwise illegal) and, therefore, deprives courts of the ability to grant effective relief from violations of state and federal law.

14. WHEREAS Plaintiffs allege that for injunctive relief prohibiting enforcement of the Transfer Eligibility Rule to be effective, the NCAA must also be enjoined from enforcing the Rule of Restitution to punish member institutions or student-athletes who immediately participate in intercollegiate competition following a transfer.

15. WHEREAS following an evidentiary hearing, the Court entered a temporary restraining order and preliminary injunctive relief against the NCAA enjoining enforcement of the Transfer Eligibility Rule and the Rule of Restitution. Dkt. 39, 63.

16. WHEREAS Plaintiffs allege that absent permanent injunctive relief, Division I student-athletes will continue to suffer irreparable harm from the Transfer Eligibility Rule, whether by missing games that cannot be replayed, failing to secure NIL deals or professional opportunities that would otherwise be available, or foregoing transfer decisions they would otherwise pursue.

17. WHEREAS Plaintiffs allege that the balance of the equities favors issuing a permanent injunction, and issuance of a permanent injunction is in the public interest.

18. WHEREAS the Plaintiff States and the NCAA have agreed to resolve this matter by entry of this Consent Judgment.

**Accordingly, it is HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:**

19. The foregoing recitals are incorporated and made a part of this Consent Judgment.

20. The NCAA shall take all steps necessary to comply with this Consent Judgment.

21. This Consent Judgment resolves only Plaintiff States' claims with respect to the Transfer Eligibility Rule as applied to Division I student-athletes and does not affect other Bylaws or claims not made in this action. For the avoidance of doubt, this Final Judgment does not apply to any Bylaws of NCAA Division II or NCAA Division III nor does it resolve any antitrust claims regarding those rules.

22. The NCAA and any person or organization acting in concert with it (including but not limited to its officers, employees, staff, member institutions, councils, and committees), are permanently restrained and enjoined from:

- a. enforcing the Transfer Eligibility Rule, NCAA Bylaw 14.5.5.1, or any substantially similar rule requiring a Division I student-athlete to maintain a period of residence or otherwise refrain from competition solely because of a transfer between NCAA member institutions;
- b. enforcing the Rule of Restitution, NCAA Bylaw 12.11.4.2, on any Division I member institution or student-athlete related to a student-athlete's participation in intercollegiate competition following a transfer in reliance on this Court's temporary restraining order or preliminary injunction or this Consent Judgment;
- c. taking any other action to retaliate against a Division I member institution for conduct related to the Transfer Eligibility Rule,

including but not limited to (i) supporting a student-athlete who challenged the Transfer Eligibility Rule or (ii) permitting a student-athlete to compete during the period of this Court's temporary restraining order or its preliminary injunction in reliance on those orders; and

- d. taking any action to retaliate against any Division I student-athlete that transferred NCAA member institutions, including but not limited to those student-athletes who (i) challenged the Transfer Eligibility Rule, (ii) sought a waiver from the Transfer Eligibility Rule, or (iii) competed during the period of this Court's temporary restraining order or its preliminary injunction in reliance on those orders.

23. The NCAA shall provide an additional year of eligibility to any Division I student-athlete who was deemed ineligible to compete for a season or any portion of a season of competition occurring during or since the 2019-20 academic year because of the Transfer Eligibility Rule provided the student-athlete:

- a. transferred between two member institutions more than once;
- b. is currently enrolled at a Division I member institution; and
- c. is currently eligible to compete, or their eligibility expired at the end of a season of competition completed during the 2023-24 academic year.

For the avoidance of doubt, a Division I student-athlete described in this provision shall have no fewer than six calendar years to complete their four seasons of

intercollegiate competition in any one sport (see NCAA Bylaw 12.8), instead of the five calendar years set forth under NCAA Bylaw 12.8.1. Within sixty (60) days of entry of this Consent Judgment, the NCAA shall post a copy of this Consent Judgment on its public web site.

24. The NCAA shall not take any action, nor adopt any rules, by-laws or policies that have the effect of undermining or circumventing the provisions of this Consent Judgment.

25. The NCAA shall pay the Plaintiff States their reasonable fees and costs incurred in prosecuting this action in an amount previously agreed upon by the parties.

26. The Court will retain jurisdiction for purposes of enforcing this Consent Judgment and resolving any dispute that may arise under it.

SO ORDERED this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_.

---

The Honorable John Preston Bailey  
United States District Judge

SO AGREED:

Date: May 30, 2024

/s/ Derek M. Whiddon

Derek M. Whiddon  
Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust Section  
Office of the Ohio Attorney General  
FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF OHIO

/s/ Bryn Williams

Bryn Williams  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Colorado Department of Law  
Office of the Attorney General  
FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF COLORADO

/s/ Adam Gitlin

Adam Gitlin  
Chief, Antitrust and Nonprofit Enforcement Section  
Office of the Attorney General for the District of Columbia  
FOR PLAINTIFF DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

/s/ Elizabeth L. Maxeiner

Elizabeth L. Maxeiner  
Chief, Antitrust Bureau  
Office of the Illinois Attorney General  
FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF ILLINOIS

/s/ Elizabeth Odette

Elizabeth Odette  
Assistant Attorney General, Manager, Antitrust Division  
Office of the Minnesota Attorney General  
FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF MINNESOTA

/s/ Caleb Pracht

Caleb Pracht  
Special Assistant Attorney General, Consumer Protection Division  
Mississippi Office of the Attorney General  
FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF MISSISSIPPI

/s/ Elinor R. Hoffmann

Elinor R. Hoffmann  
Chief, Antitrust Bureau  
New York State Office of the Attorney General  
FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF NEW YORK

/s/ Jonathan R. Marx

Jonathan R. Marx  
Special Deputy Attorney General  
North Carolina Department of Justice  
FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA

/s/ J. David McDowell

J. David McDowell  
Deputy, Consumer Protection Division  
Office of the Attorney General and Reporter  
FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF TENNESSEE

/s/ Tyler T. Henry

Tyler T. Henry  
Senior Assistant Attorney General and Manager  
Antitrust Unit  
Office of the Virginia Attorney General  
FOR PLAINTIFF COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA

/s/ Douglas L. Davis

Douglas L. Davis  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the West Virginia Attorney General  
FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA AND AS LOCAL COUNSEL FOR  
THE PLAINTIFF STATES

/s/ Phillip D. Bartz

Philip D. Bartz  
Bryan Cave Leighton Paisner LLP  
COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANT NATIONAL COLLEGIATE ATHLETIC  
ASSOCIATION

/s/ Benjamin L. Bailey

Benjamin L. Bailey  
Bailey & Glasser LLP  
LOCAL COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANT NATIONAL COLLEGIATE ATHLETIC  
ASSOCIATION